

A characterization of certain finite groups of odd order

Ashish Kumar Das and Rajat Kanti Nath

*Department of Mathematics, North-Eastern Hill University,
Permanent Campus, Shillong-793022, Meghalaya, India.
Emails: akdasnehu@gmail.com, rajatkantinath@yahoo.com*

Abstract

The commutativity degree of a finite group is the probability that two randomly chosen group elements commute. The main object of this paper is to obtain a characterization for all finite groups of odd order with commutativity degree greater than or equal to $\frac{11}{15}$.

Key words: finite groups, conjugacy classes, commutativity degree.

2010 Mathematics Subject Classification: 20D60, 20E45, 20P05.

1 Introduction

Throughout this paper G denotes a finite group with commutator subgroup G' and center $Z(G)$. Recall that the commutativity degree of G is defined as the ratio

$$\Pr(G) = \frac{|\{(x, y) \in G \times G : [x, y] = 1\}|}{|G \times G|}, \quad (1)$$

where $[x, y] = xyx^{-1}y^{-1}$ is the commutator of $x, y \in G$. Clearly, $\Pr(G) = 1$ if and only if G is abelian. Gustafson [3] has shown that if G is non-abelian, then $\Pr(G) \leq \frac{5}{8}$. Rusin [8], has computed the values of $\Pr(G)$ when $G' \subseteq Z(G)$, and also when $G' \cap Z(G) = \{1\}$. Moreover, he has characterized all

G with $\Pr(G) > \frac{11}{32}$. Barry et al. [1] have shown that G is supersolvable if $\Pr(G) > \frac{11}{75}$ and $|G|$ is odd.

In this paper, we determine the value of $\Pr(G)$ and the size of $\frac{G}{Z(G)}$ when $|G'| = p^2$ and $|G' \cap Z(G)| = p$, where p is a prime such that $\gcd(p-1, |G|) = 1$. Then, using this and few other supplementary results, we characterize all G of odd order with $\Pr(G) \geq \frac{11}{75}$.

2 Some auxiliary results

It is well-known that $|Cl_G(x)|$ divides $|G|$ for all $x \in G$. In fact, we have

$$|G : C_G(x)| = |Cl_G(x)| = |[G, x]| \quad (2)$$

for all $x \in G$, where $Cl_G(x)$ and $C_G(x)$ are the conjugacy class and the centralizer of x in G , and $[G, x] = \{[y, x] : y \in G\}$. It may be mentioned here that $[G, x]$ is not necessarily a subgroup of G .

Let p be the smallest prime divisor of $|G|$. Then, from (2), we get

$$p \leq |Cl_G(x)| \leq |G'| \iff x \in G - Z(G). \quad (3)$$

Also, if $|Cl_G(x)| = p$, for some $x \in G$, then $G/C_G(x)$ forms an abelian group, and so, $G' \subseteq C_G(x)$, which means that $x \in C_G(G')$, the centralizer of G' in G . Thus, for all $x \in G - C_G(G')$, we have

$$p < |Cl_G(x)|. \quad (4)$$

Note that $C_G(G') = \bigcap_{x \in G'} C_G(x) \trianglelefteq G$. So, by (2), $|Cl_G(x)|$ divides $|\frac{G}{C_G(G')}|$ for all $x \in G'$. Moreover, $\frac{G}{C_G(G')}$ is abelian if and only if G' is abelian, and in either case $[C_G(G'), x]$ is a subgroup of G' for all $x \in G$, a fact that can be easily established using the commutator identities

$$[xy, z] = x[y, z]x^{-1}[x, z], \text{ and } [x, yz] = [x, y]y[x, z]y^{-1} \quad (5)$$

where $x, y, z \in G$. Also, using the Jacobi identity [7, page 93], we have

$$(C_G(G'))' \subseteq Z(G) \subseteq Z(C_G(G')). \quad (6)$$

Lemma 2.1. *Let p be a prime. Let $\text{Aut}(G')$ denote the automorphism group of G' and C_p the cyclic group of order p .*

- (a) $\frac{G}{C_G(G')}$ can be embedded in $\text{Aut}(G')$, and so, $|\text{Cl}_G(x)|$ divides $|\text{Aut}(G')|$ for all $x \in G'$.
- (b) If $\frac{G}{C_G(G')} \cong C_p$, then $\langle x, C_G(G') \rangle = G$, $[G, x] = [C_G(G'), x]$ and $|\text{Cl}_G(x)|$ divides $|G'|$ for all $x \in G - C_G(G')$.

Proof. Part (a) follows from [7, theorem 7.1(i), page 130], and part (b) from (2) and (5), noting that $[C_G(G'), x]$ is a subgroup of G' . $\square$

It is easy to see, from (1), that if H and K are two finite groups then

$$\Pr(H \times K) = \Pr(H) \Pr(K). \quad (7)$$

In view of this, the following result, which generalizes [1, lemma 3.8], simplifies our task considerably.

Lemma 2.2. *Let p be a prime such that $\gcd(p-1, |G|) = 1$. If $|G'| = p^2$ and $|G' \cap Z(G)| = p$, then G is nilpotent of class 3; in particular, $G \cong P \times A$, where A is an abelian group and P is a p -group such that $|P'| = p^2$ and $|P' \cap Z(P)| = p$.*

Proof. We have

$$\left| \left(\frac{G}{Z(G)} \right)' \right| = \left| \frac{G'Z(G)}{Z(G)} \right| = \left| \frac{G'}{G' \cap Z(G)} \right| = p.$$

Therefore, it follows from Lemma 2.1(a) that $G/Z(G)$ is nilpotent of class 2, and so, G is nilpotent of class 3; in particular, G is the direct product of its Sylow subgroups. Hence, the lemma follows. $\square$

Given $H \subseteq G$, consider the set $H^* = \{x \in G : [G, x] \subseteq H\}$. Then, we have

Lemma 2.3. [8, section I] *If $H, H_1, H_2 \trianglelefteq G$, then*

- (a) $(G' \cap H)^* = H^*$, $\{1\}^* = Z(G)$, and $(G')^* = G$,
- (b) $(H_1 \cap H_2)^* = H_1^* \cap H_2^*$, and $H_1^* H_2^* \subseteq (H_1 H_2)^*$,
- (c) $H_1 \subseteq H_2 \implies H_1^* \subseteq H_2^*$,
- (d) $H \trianglelefteq H^* \trianglelefteq G$, and $Z(G/H) = H^*/H$,

(e) G/H^* is never a nontrivial cyclic group.

The following result is well-known (see [5]), and also can be derived easily from the degree equation [4, corollary 2.7].

Lemma 2.4. *Let p be the smallest prime divisor of $|G|$. Then*

$$\Pr(G) \leq \frac{1}{|G'|} \left(1 + \frac{|G'| - 1}{p^2} \right)$$

with equality if and only if each non-linear irreducible complex character of G is of degree p .

We conclude this section reformulating a few more known results.

Lemma 2.5. [8, section II] *Let p be a prime and G be a p -group with $G' \subseteq Z(G)$. Then*

$$\Pr(G) = \frac{1}{|G'|} \left(1 + \sum_{\substack{K \leq G' \\ G'/K \text{ cyclic}}} \frac{(p-1)|G' : K|}{p|G : K^*|} \right),$$

where $\frac{G}{K^*} \cong \prod (C_{p^{n_i}} \times C_{p^{n_i}})$ with $p \leq p^{n_i} \leq p^{n_1} = p^k = |G' : K|$.

Lemma 2.6. [8, section III] *Let p be a prime. If $|G'| = p$ and $G' \cap Z(G) = \{1\}$, then $\frac{G}{Z(G)}$ is a non-abelian group of order pn and*

$$\Pr(G) = \frac{n^2 + p - 1}{pn^2},$$

where $n > 1$ is a divisor of $p - 1$.

Lemma 2.7. [2, page 303] *If G is non-abelian, $H \trianglelefteq G$ and $|G : H| = p$, where p is a prime, then*

$$\Pr(G) = \frac{\Pr(H)}{p^2} + \frac{p+1}{p|G|^2} \sum_{x \in G-H} |C_G(x)|.$$

Moreover, if H is abelian, then $|\frac{G}{Z(G)}| = p|G'|$, $|C_G(x)| = |G : G'|$ for all $x \in G - H$, and

$$\Pr(G) = \frac{1}{p^2} + \frac{p^2 - 1}{p^2|G'|}.$$

Finally, using GAP [9], we have

Remark 2.8. If $G' \not\subseteq Z(G)$, then $\frac{G}{Z(G)}$ is isomorphic to $C_7 \rtimes C_3$, $(C_3 \times C_3) \rtimes C_3$, $C_{13} \rtimes C_3$, $C_{19} \rtimes C_3$, $C_3 \times (C_7 \rtimes C_3)$ or $(C_5 \times C_5) \rtimes C_3$ according as $|\frac{G}{Z(G)}|$ is 21, 27, 39, 57, 63 or 75, where $\rtimes$ stands for semidirect product [7, page 137].

3 Groups with $|G'| = p^2$ and $|G' \cap Z(G)| = p$

In this section we derive a formula for $\text{Pr}(G)$ and determine the size of $\frac{G}{Z(G)}$ when $|G'| = p^2$ and $|G' \cap Z(G)| = p$, where p is a prime such that $\gcd(p-1, |G|) = 1$.

Lemma 3.1. *Let p be a prime. If $|G' \cap Z(G)| = p$ and $C_G(G')$ is non-abelian, then there is a positive integer s such that $\frac{C_G(G')}{Z(C_G(G'))} \cong (C_p \times C_p)^s$ and*

$$\text{Pr}(C_G(G')) = \frac{1}{p} \left(1 + \frac{p-1}{p^{2s}} \right).$$

Proof. In view of (6), the result follows from Lemma 2.5. $\square$

Lemma 3.2. *Let p be a prime and $G' \not\subseteq Z(G)$ such that one of the following conditions holds:*

- (a) $G' \cong C_{p^2}$ and $\gcd(p-1, |G|) = 1$,
- (b) $G' \cong C_p \times C_p$ and $\gcd(p^2-1, |G|) = 1$.

Then $|\frac{G}{C_G(G')}| = |G' \cap Z(G)| = |\text{Cl}_G(x)| = p$ for all $x \in G' - Z(G)$.

Proof. Since $|\text{Aut}(C_{p^2})| = p(p-1)$, $|\text{Aut}(C_p \times C_p)| = p(p+1)(p-1)^2$ and $G' - Z(G)$ is a union of conjugacy classes of G , the result follows from Lemma 2.1(a). $\square$

Lemma 3.3. *If $G' \not\subseteq Z(G)$ and $|\frac{G}{C_G(G')}| = |G' \cap Z(G)| = p$, where p is the smallest prime divisor of $|G|$, then $Z(G)^* \subsetneq C_G(G')$ and $\frac{C_G(G')}{Z(G)^*}$ can be embedded in $\frac{G'}{G' \cap Z(G)}$.*

Proof. By Lemma 2.3(e), $Z(G)^* \neq C_G(G')$. Let $z \in Z(G)^*$. Using (2) and the definition of $Z(G)^*$, we have $|\text{Cl}_G(z)| \leq |G' \cap Z(G)| = p$. So, by (4), $z \in C_G(G')$. Thus, $Z(G)^* \subsetneq C_G(G')$. Now, let $x \in G - C_G(G')$ and note that G' is abelian. Using (5), it is easy to see that the mapping $f: C_G(G') \rightarrow G'Z(G)/Z(G)$, defined by $f(z) = [z, x]Z(G)$, is a homomorphism. Also, using the definition of $Z(G)^*$ together with (6) and Lemma 2.1(b), we have $\ker f = Z(G)^*$. Thus, it follows that $C_G(G')/Z(G)^*$ is isomorphic to a subgroup of $\frac{G'Z(G)}{Z(G)}$. $\square$

Lemma 3.4. *Let p be a prime. If G is a p -group such that $|G' \cap Z(G)| = p$ and $|G'| = p^2$, then $Z(G)^* \cap Z(C_G(G')) = G'Z(G)$.*

Proof. By Lemma 3.2, $\frac{G}{C_G(G')}$ is abelian. Also, by Lemma 2.2, G is nilpotent of class 3. So, it follows that $G'Z(G) \subseteq Z(G)^* \cap Z(C_G(G'))$. For the other direction, choose $x \in G - C_G(G')$ and $y \in G' - Z(G)$ arbitrarily. Then, by Lemma 2.1(b), $C_G(x) \cap Z(C_G(G')) = Z(G)$. It follows that $[y^{-1}, x] \neq 1$, since $y \notin Z(G)$. Now, let $z \in Z(G)^* \cap Z(C_G(G'))$. Since $y, z \in Z(G)^*$, we have $[z, x], [y^{-1}, x] \in G' \cap Z(G)$, a cyclic group of order p . So, there exists a positive integer i with $1 \leq i \leq p-1$ such that $[z, x] = [y^{-1}, x]^i = [y^{-i}, x]$, or equivalently, $y^i z \in C_G(x)$. Since $x \in G - C_G(G')$ is chosen arbitrarily, $y \in G' \subseteq Z(C_G(G'))$ and $z \in Z(C_G(G'))$, it follows that $z \in G'Z(G)$. This completes the proof. $\square$

We now prove the main result of this section.

Theorem 3.5. *Let p be a prime such that $\gcd(p-1, |G|) = 1$. If $|G'| = p^2$ and $|G' \cap Z(G)| = p$, then*

$$(a) \quad \Pr(G) = \begin{cases} \frac{2p^2-1}{p^4} & \text{if } C_G(G') \text{ is abelian} \\ \frac{1}{p^4} \left(\frac{p-1}{p^{2s-1}} + p^2 + p - 1 \right) & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases}$$

$$(b) \quad \left| \frac{G}{Z(G)} \right| = \begin{cases} p^3 & \text{if } C_G(G') \text{ is abelian} \\ p^{2s+2} \text{ or } p^{2s+3} & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases}$$

where $p^{2s} = |C_G(G') : Z(C_G(G'))|$. Moreover,

$$\left| \frac{G}{G' \cap Z(G)} : Z\left(\frac{G}{G' \cap Z(G)}\right) \right| = \left| \frac{G}{Z(G)} : Z\left(\frac{G}{Z(G)}\right) \right| = p^2.$$

Proof. In view of Lemma 2.2, we can assume that G is a p -group. Therefore, by Lemma 3.2, we have $|G : C_G(G')| = p$.

(a) If $x \in G - C_G(G')$, then it follows from (4) and Lemma 2.1(b) that $|Cl_G(x)| = p^2$, and so, $|C_G(x)| = |G|/p^2$. Now, the result can be easily deduced from Lemma 2.7 and Lemma 3.1.

(b) By Lemma 3.3, we have $|C_G(G') : Z(G)^*| = p$. Therefore, using the second isomorphism theorem [7, page 25] and Lemma 3.4, we have

$$|Z(C_G(G')) : G'Z(G)| = \begin{cases} p & \text{if } C_G(G') \text{ is abelian} \\ 1 \text{ or } p & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}$$

Hence, using the first part of Lemma 3.1, the result follows from the normal series $Z(G) \subseteq G'Z(G) \subseteq Z(C_G(G')) \subseteq C_G(G') \subseteq G$.

The final statement follows from Lemma 3.3 and Lemma 2.3(a)(d). $\square$

4 Groups of odd order with $\text{Pr}(G) \geq \frac{11}{75}$

In this section we accomplish our main objective.

Lemma 4.1. *Let $|G|$ be odd.*

- (a) *If $G' \cong C_{15}$, then $G' \subseteq Z(G)$.*
- (b) *If $G' \cong C_{21}$ and $G' \not\subseteq Z(G)$, then $|\frac{G}{C_G(G')}| = |G' \cap Z(G)| = 3$ and exactly one of the following conditions holds:*
 - (i) $|Cl_G(x)| = 21$ for all $x \in G - C_G(G')$.
 - (ii) *There exists a subset X of $G - C_G(G')$ such that*

$$\begin{aligned} |X| &= 2|Z(C_G(G'))| \quad \text{and} \\ |Cl_G(x)| &= \begin{cases} 7 & \text{if } x \in X \\ 21 & \text{if } x \in G - (C_G(G') \cup X). \end{cases} \end{aligned}$$

Proof. Note that $|\text{Aut}(C_{15})| = 8$ and $|\text{Aut}(C_{21})| = 12$. Therefore, (a) and the first part of (b) follow from Lemma 2.1(a).

For the second part of (b), we begin with an observation, which follows from (4) and Lemma 2.1(b), that $|Cl_G(x)| = 7$ or 21 for all $x \in G - C_G(G')$.

Assume that the condition (b)(i) fails to hold. Then, $|\text{Cl}_G(x_0)| = 7$ for some $x_0 \in G - C_G(G')$. Since $|\frac{G}{C_G(G')}| = 3$, it is easy to see that

$$G - C_G(G') = x_0 C_G(G') \sqcup x_0^{-1} C_G(G'). \quad (8)$$

Let us write $X = x_0 Z(C_G(G')) \sqcup x_0^{-1} Z(C_G(G'))$. Clearly, $X \subseteq G - C_G(G')$ and $|X| = 2|Z(C_G(G'))|$. Since $|\text{Cl}_G(x_0)| = |\text{Cl}_G(x_0^{-1})|$, it follows from (2), (5) and Lemma 2.1(b) that $|\text{Cl}_G(x)| = 7$ for all $x \in X$. On the other hand, consider an element $x \in G - (C_G(G') \cup X)$. Using (8), we have $x = x_0 w$ or $x_0^{-1} w$ for some $w \in C_G(G') - Z(C_G(G'))$. Choose $w_1 \in C_G(G') - Z(C_G(G'))$ such that $[w_1, w] \neq 1$. Then, by (5) and (6), we have

$$[w_1, x] = \begin{cases} [w_1, x_0][w_1, w] & \text{if } x = x_0 w \\ [w_1, x_0^{-1}][w_1, w] & \text{if } x = x_0^{-1} w. \end{cases}$$

Note that $\text{ord}([w_1, w]) = 3$ and $\text{ord}([w_1, x_0]) = \text{ord}([w_1, x_0^{-1}]) = 1$ or 7 , and so, it follows that $\text{ord}([w_1, x]) = 3$ or 21 . Thus, using (2), we have $|\text{Cl}_G(x)| = 21$. $\square$

Lemma 4.2. *If $|G| \equiv 3 \pmod{6}$, $G' \cong C_5 \times C_5$ and $|G' \cap Z(G)| = 1$, then*

(a) $|\text{Cl}_G(x)| = 3$ for all $x \in G' - Z(G)$,

(b) $|\frac{G}{C_G(G')}| = 3$.

Proof. Note that no non-identity element of G is conjugate to its inverse, and also that $G' - Z(G)$ is a union of conjugacy classes of G .

(a) Let $x \in G' - Z(G)$. Since $|G' - Z(G)| = 24$, we have $|\text{Cl}_G(x)| \leq 12$. This, in view of Lemma 2.1(a), implies that $|\text{Cl}_G(x)| = 3$ or 5 . Since $x^5 = 1$, the classes $\text{Cl}_G(x)$, $\text{Cl}_G(x^2)$, $\text{Cl}_G(x^3)$ and $\text{Cl}_G(x^4)$ are distinct but have the same size. Now, looking at the partitions of 24 with 3 and 5 as summands, we get the result.

(b) Suppose that there exist $x, y \in G' - Z(G)$ such that $C_G(x) \neq C_G(y)$. By part (a), we have $|G : C_G(x)| = |G : C_G(y)| = 3$. Therefore,

$$\left| \frac{C_G(x)}{C_G(x) \cap C_G(y)} \right| = \left| \frac{C_G(x)C_G(y)}{C_G(y)} \right| = \left| \frac{G}{C_G(y)} \right| = 3.$$

This, considering the series $C_G(G') \subseteq C_G(x) \cap C_G(y) \subseteq C_G(x) \subseteq G$, implies that 9 divides $|\frac{G}{C_G(G')}|$. But, in view of Lemma 2.1(a), $|\frac{G}{C_G(G')}| = 3, 5$, or 15 . Hence, we must have $C_G(x) = C_G(y)$ for all $x, y \in G' - Z(G)$, and so, the result follows. $\square$

We are now in a position to characterize all finite groups of odd order with commutativity degree at least $\frac{11}{75}$.

Theorem 4.3. *If $|G|$ is odd and $\Pr(G) \geq \frac{11}{75}$, then the possible values of $\Pr(G)$ and the corresponding structures of G' , $G' \cap Z(G)$ and $G/Z(G)$ are given as follows:*

$\Pr(G)$	G'	$G' \cap Z(G)$	$G/Z(G)$
1	$\{1\}$	$\{1\}$	$\{1\}$
$(1 + 2/3^{2s})/3$	C_3	C_3	$(C_3 \times C_3)^s, s \geq 1$
$(1 + 4/5^{2s})/5$	C_5	C_5	$(C_5 \times C_5)^s, s \geq 1$
5/21	C_7	$\{1\}$	$C_7 \rtimes C_3$
55/343	C_7	C_7	$C_7 \times C_7$
17/81	C_9 or $C_3 \times C_3$	C_3	$(C_3 \times C_3) \rtimes C_3$
	$C_3 \times C_3$	$C_3 \times C_3$	C_3^3
121/729	$C_3 \times C_3$	$C_3 \times C_3$	C_3^4
7/39	C_{13}	$\{1\}$	$C_{13} \rtimes C_3$
3/19	C_{19}	$\{1\}$	$C_{19} \rtimes C_3$
29/189	C_{21}	C_3	$C_3 \times (C_7 \rtimes C_3)$
11/75	$C_5 \times C_5$	$\{1\}$	$(C_5 \times C_5) \rtimes C_3$

Proof. It is enough to assume that G is non-abelian. By Lemma 2.4, we have $|G'| \leq 25$. Also, by [6, lemma 7], G' is not isomorphic to the unique non-abelian group of order 21. Therefore, it follows that G' is isomorphic to $C_3 \times C_3$, C_9 , C_{15} , C_{21} , $C_5 \times C_5$, C_{25} or C_p , where p is an odd prime with $p \leq 23$.

Case 1. $G' \subseteq Z(G)$.

If $G' \cong C_p$, then, by Lemma 2.5, there exists a positive integer s such that $\frac{G}{Z(G)} \cong (C_p \times C_p)^s$ and

$$\Pr(G) = \frac{1}{p} \left(1 + \frac{p-1}{p^{2s}} \right).$$

It follows that s can have infinitely many values for $p = 3$ and 5, whereas $s = 1$ is the only possibility if $p = 7$. For the rest of the values of p , we have $\Pr(G) < \frac{11}{75}$.

If $G' \cong C_3 \times C_3$, then, by Lemma 2.5, we have

$$\Pr(G) = \frac{1}{9} \left[1 + \frac{2}{3^{2m_1}} + \frac{2}{3^{2m_2}} + \frac{2}{3^{2m_3}} + \frac{2}{3^{2m_4}} \right],$$

with $3^{2m_i} = |\frac{G}{K_i^*}|$, $1 \leq i \leq 4$, where K_1, K_2, K_3 and K_4 are the proper subgroups of G' . A close study of the subgroups K_1^*, K_2^*, K_3^* and K_4^* , using Lemma 2.3, reveals that $\frac{17}{81}$ (if $m_1 = m_2 = m_3 = m_4 = 1$) and $\frac{121}{729}$ (if $m_1 = m_2 = 1, m_3 = m_4 = 2$) are the only values of $\text{Pr}(G)$, in the interval $[\frac{11}{75}, 1]$, and on each occasion $\frac{G}{Z(G)}$ is an elementary abelian 3-group with $|\frac{G}{Z(G)}| \leq 81$. In fact, if $\text{Pr}(G) = \frac{121}{729}$, then we have $|\frac{G}{Z(G)}| = 81$, and if $\text{Pr}(G) = \frac{17}{81}$, then equality holds in Lemma 2.4, and so, using [4, theorem 12.11] and the second part of Lemma 2.7, we have $|\frac{G}{Z(G)}| = 27$.

By (7) and Lemma 2.5, we have $\text{Pr}(G) < \frac{11}{75}$ for the other possibilities of G' .

Case 2. $G' \cap Z(G) = \{1\}$.

In this case, by (6), $C_G(G')$ is an abelian group. Also, in view of Lemma 2.1(a), Lemma 3.2 and Lemma 4.1, it is not possible to have $|G'| = 3, 5, 9, 15, 17$ or 21 .

If $|G'| = 7, 11, 13, 19$ or 23 , then $\text{Pr}(G)$ and $|G/Z(G)|$ are determined by Lemma 2.6. More precisely, since there is a unique odd divisor $n > 1$ of $p - 1$ for each $p \in \{7, 11, 13, 23\}$, we have $\text{Pr}(G) = \frac{5}{21}$ and $|G/Z(G)| = 21$ if $|G'| = 7$, and $\text{Pr}(G) = \frac{7}{39}$ and $|G/Z(G)| = 39$ if $|G'| = 13$, while $\text{Pr}(G) < \frac{11}{75}$ if $|G'| = 11$ or 23 . On the other hand, if $p = 19$, then there are two such odd divisors ($n = 3$ and $n = 9$) of $p - 1$. It can be seen that if $n = 3$, then $\text{Pr}(G) = \frac{3}{19}$ and $|G/Z(G)| = 57$, whereas $\text{Pr}(G) < \frac{11}{75}$ if $n = 9$.

If $|G'| = 25$, then, in view of Lemma 3.2, we must have $G' \cong C_5 \times C_5$ and $|G| \equiv 3 \pmod{6}$. So, using Lemma 4.2(b) and the second part of Lemma 2.7, we have $\text{Pr}(G) = \frac{11}{75}$ and $|\frac{G}{Z(G)}| = 75$.

Case 3. $G' \not\subseteq Z(G)$ and $G' \cap Z(G) \neq \{1\}$.

In this case, $|G'| = 9, 21$ or 25 ($|G'| \neq 15$, by Lemma 4.1(a)).

If $|G'| = 9$, then $|G' \cap Z(G)| = 3$. Using Theorem 3.5, we see that $\frac{17}{81}$ is the only value of $\text{Pr}(G)$, in the interval $[\frac{11}{75}, 1]$, and it occurs when $C_G(G')$ is abelian. Also, in that case, we have $|\frac{G}{Z(G)}| = 27$.

If $|G'| = 21$, then, by Lemma 4.1(b), $|G' \cap Z(G)| = 3$. Using Lemma 2.7 together with Lemma 3.1 and Lemma 4.1(b), we see that $\frac{29}{189}$ is the only value of $\text{Pr}(G)$, in the interval $[\frac{11}{75}, 1]$, and it occurs when $C_G(G')$ is abelian. Also, in that case $|\frac{G}{Z(G)}| = 63$.

Finally, if $|G'| = 25$, then $|G' \cap Z(G)| = 5$. But, using Theorem 3.5, we see that $\text{Pr}(G) < \frac{11}{75}$.

Thus, in view of Remark 2.8, the theorem is completely proved. $\square$

We conclude our discussion with the following remark.

Remark 4.4. In [8, section IV], Rusin classifies all G with $\Pr(G) > \frac{11}{32}$. However, there are a few of points that are worth noting.

- (a) In case 2, he misses out one situation, where we have $\Pr(G) = \frac{5}{14}$, $G' \cong C_7$, $G' \cap Z(G) = \{1\}$, and $\frac{G}{Z(G)} \cong D_7$, the dihedral group of order 14.
- (b) In case 3, he claims to have shown that if $|G'| = 4$ and $|G' \cap Z(G)| = 2$, then $\Pr(G) = 1/4 \cdot (1 + 1/2^{2t} + 1/2 \cdot 1/2^{2s})$ with $2^{2s} = [C_G(G') : Z(C_G(G'))]$, $2^{2t} = |\frac{G}{G' \cap Z(G)} : Z(\frac{G}{G' \cap Z(G)})|$ and $s + 1 \geq t \geq 1$. But, putting $p = 2$ in Theorem 3.5, we see that $t = 1$ is the only possibility.
- (c) In the summary, he writes that if $C_2 \times C_2 \cong G' \subseteq Z(G)$, then $\frac{G}{Z(G)} \cong C_2^3$ or C_2^4 , and $\Pr(G) = \frac{7}{16}$ or $\frac{25}{64}$. However, arguing in the same manner as we have done in a similar situation (namely, $C_3 \times C_3 \cong G' \subseteq Z(G)$) in the proof of Theorem 4.3, we see that $\frac{G}{Z(G)} \cong C_2^3$ or C_2^4 according as $\Pr(G) = \frac{7}{16}$ or $\frac{25}{64}$. Rusin also writes that if $\Pr(G) = \frac{3}{8}$, $G' \cong C_6$ and $G' \cap Z(G) \cong C_2$, then $\frac{G}{Z(G)} \cong C_2 \times S_3$ or T , where T is the non-abelian group of order 12 besides A_4 and $C_2 \times S_3$. But, it is well-known that $T \not\cong \frac{G}{Z(G)}$ for any G .

References

- [1] F. Barry, D. MacHale, and Á. Ní Shé, 2006 Some supersolvability conditions for finite groups. *Mathematical Proceedings of the Royal Irish Academy* **106A**, 163–177.
- [2] Ya. G. Berkovich, and E. M. Zhmud', 1998 *Characters of Finite Groups. Part 1*. Translations of Mathematical Monographs **172**, American Mathematical Society, Providence, RI.
- [3] W. H. Gustafson, 1973 What is the probability that two group elements commute? *American Mathematical Monthly* **80**, 1031–1034.
- [4] I. M. Isaacs, 1994 *Character theory of finite groups*. Dover Publications. Inc. New York.

- [5] K. S. Joseph, 1969 Commutativity in non-abelian groups. Unpublished Ph. D. thesis. University of California. Los Angeles.
- [6] D. Machale, and P. Ó Murchú, 1993 Commutator subgroups of groups with small central factor groups. *Mathematical Proceedings of the Royal Irish Academy* **93A**, 123–129.
- [7] J. J. Rotman, 1984 *An introduction to the theory of groups* (3rd edn). Allyn and Bacon. Inc.
- [8] D. J. Rusin, 1979 What is the probability that two elements of a finite group commute? *Pacific Journal Mathematics* **82**, 237–247.
- [9] The GAP Group, 2008 GAP – Groups, Algorithms, and Programming. Version 4.4.12. <http://www.gap-system.org>